



Vital Statistics Advisory Committee (VSAC)
Vital Records Protection Advisory Committee (VRPAC)
Joint Meeting
Meeting Minutes for Wednesday March 11, 2015
9:00 A.M.



EDMUND G. BROWN JR.
Governor

ATTENDEES:

Convener:

Henry Montes, Chief, Data Management Unit

Committee Members:

Absent: Sun Lee, MPH, Los Angeles County Department of Public Health

Phone: David Grant, PhD., UCLA Center for Health Policy Research, Emily Putnam-Hornstein, PhD, University of Southern California, Jonathan Teague, MCRP, Office of Statewide Health Planning and Development, Erlinda Valdez, Board Member, California Funeral Directors Association

Present: Shannon Muir, PhD, Science and Technology Fellow, Senate Health Committee

California Department of Public Health (CDPH) Staff:

Present: Elaine Badley, MHA, Chief, Public Health Policy and Research Branch, Henry Montes, Chief, Data Management Unit, Colin Chew, Research Analyst I, DMU, Laura Lund, MA, Science Advisor, Public Health Policy and Research Branch, Heather Fukushima, HPS I, Health Information and Research Section

Public Attendees: No Public Attendees were present at the meeting.

CALL TO ORDER: The meeting was called to order at 9:05 A.M.

A/B. WELCOME/INTRODUCTIONS:

Henry welcomed Shannon Muir, the new VSAC Committee member. She is the Science and Technology Fellow for the California Senate Health Committee. She has a PhD in Biomedical Science from San Diego.

Staff and Committee present attending the meeting included Elaine Badley, MHA, Chief, Public Health Policy and Research Branch, Henry Montes, Chief, Data Management Unit, Laura Lund, MA, Science Advisor, Public Health Policy and Research Branch, Colin Chew, Research Analyst I, Public Health Policy and Research Branch, Cindy Tanaka-Fong, Research Analyst II, Data Management Unit, Heather Fukushima, HPS I, Health Information and Research Section, and Shannon, Muir, PhD, Science and Technology Fellow, Senate Health Committee

Committee members on the phone included Emily Putnam-Hornstein, PhD, Assistant Professor, University of Southern California, David Grant, PhD., Director, California Health Interview Survey, UCLA Center for Health Policy Research Jonathan Teague, MCRP, Office of Statewide Health Planning and Development , and Erlinda Valdez, Board Member, California Funeral Directors Association.

Henry announced that there were 3 changes made to the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act for 2015. The three changes are: 1. For all action items at board meetings and meetings of committees of three or more, the law now requires boards to record the vote or abstention of each member present for that action item. This means the board's minutes must include each board member's name under the appropriate vote category (i.e., yes, no abstention). 2. An agency is authorized to provide notice of board/committee meetings by regular mail, email, or both. However, a person requesting notice has the option of choosing by which of the three methods above the person wishes to receive notice and the agency must comply with the option selected by the requestor. 3. If an agency plans to web cast a meeting, then the notice of meeting must include a statement of the intent to web cast the meeting.

Henry informed everyone that the meeting was being recorded to assist with note taking purposes. We have reserved a portion of the meeting for public comment.

C. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM THE PREVIOUS MEETING:

Emily Putnam-Hornstein motioned to approve the January 14, 2015 meeting minutes. David Grant seconded the motion. Emily Putnam-Hornstein voted aye, David Grant voted aye, and Shannon Muir voted aye to approve the minutes. There were no oppositions. Jonathan Teague abstained as he was not at the meeting. Motion carried. The minutes have been approved as distributed.

D. VSAC RECOMMENDATIONS FROM THE PREVIOUS MEETING:

The State Registrar's Responses to VSAC Recommendations are included in your agenda package as Attachment 1.

E. NEW BUSINESS:

Twelve projects were reviewed.

The first project reviewed by the Committee was:

Project Title: "Environmental Health Tracking and Childhood Cancers in California"

Principal Investigator(s): Julia Heck, PhD, Beate Ritz, M.D., PhD, University of California, Los Angeles

Project Type: New Project

CPHS Approval: Approved

Project No.: 14-08-1658

Expiration: October 2, 2015

File(s) Requested: 2012-2013 Birth Statistical Master File (select variables), 2012-2013 Death Statistical Master File (select variables)

Requested Identifiers: BSMF (Name, Certificate Number, and Address), DSMF (Name, Certificate Number, Address, and Mother's Maiden Name)

Personal Contact: No

Identifiers Released: No

History: New Data Request

VSAC Discussion: No Discussion

VSAC Motion: Jonathan Teague motioned to recommend approval of the data release. Emily Putnam-Hornstein seconded the motion.

VSAC Vote: Jonathan Teague voted aye, David Grant voted aye, Erlinda Valdez voted aye, Emily Putnam-Hornstein voted aye, and Shannon Muir voted aye. There were no oppositions. Motion

carried. The Committee has voted to recommend that the State Registrar approve the use of the data as described in the protocol.

The second project reviewed by the Committee was:

Project Title: "Gestational Vitamin D and its Relationship with Autism"

Principal Investigator(s): Jaime Sconberg, PhD Candidate, Irva Hertz-Picciotto, PhD, University of California, Davis

Project Type: Continuing Project with Changes to the Protocol

CPHS Approval: Approved

Project No.: 14-01-1472

Expiration: June 5, 2015

File(s) Requested: 1998-2008 Birth Statistical Master File (select variables), 1998-2008 Death Statistical Master File (select variables), PI is requesting to use these files that were previously obtained by Dr. Irva Hertz-Picciotto

Requested Identifiers: California identifiers only

Personal Contact: No

Identifiers Released: No

History: Previous Data Request

VSAC Discussion: Comments were made that this was the project that there was some question about the use of Social Security Number (SSN) that had been earlier released on the birth records files. This is something that has come up before and not sure if we have ever resolved this regarding what is allowable vs. what is not. We also discussed talking to legal to get a better understand for clarification on the use of social security numbers.

The Science Advisor informed the Committee that our legal department has made it clear we cannot release the social security numbers from the birth files. They received SSN in the past, and they are asking to use the data again. If we brought this request before the Office of Legal Services, they would likely stay this is a new project and that the requestors cannot use the SSNs from the files that they already received. We would not release SSNs to them if we are providing new files.

One member thought the concern with this project was data destruction. The Science Advisor said that her concern was about re-release because originally the one requestor was using previous Principal Investigator's (PI) data. They made the previous investigator a co-PI.

If a researcher already has the SSNs, they are not allowed to use if for any project. If we were releasing data for this project now, we would not be giving SSN. We cannot authorize the use of just because they happen to have it for historical reasons.

The PI will have to be notified that they cannot use the social security numbers. The Committee would need to recommend to the State Registrar approve release of this but without the social security numbers.

VSAC Motion: Jonathan Teague made motion to recommend to the State Registrar to release the data to the researcher with stipulation that the social security number in the birth data would not be used. Emily Putnam-Hornstein seconded the motion.

VSAC Vote: Jonathan Teague voted aye, David Grant voted aye, Erlinda Valdez voted aye, Emily Putnam-Hornstein voted aye and Shannon Muir voted aye to recommend that the State Registrar approve the use of the data with the stipulation that the social security number in the birth data would not be used. There were no oppositions. Motion carried.

The third project reviewed by the Committee was:

Project Title: "Effect of Gender Treatment and Outcomes after Carotid Interventions"

Principal Investigator(s): Natalia Egorova, PhD, MPH, Mount Sinai School of Medicine

Project Type: Continuing Project

CPHS Approval: Approved

Project No: 12-07-0537

Expiration: October 2, 2015

File(s) Requested: 2011 PDD/Linked Death File

Requested Identifiers: California identifiers only

Personal Contact: No

Identifiers Released: No

History: Previous Data Request

VSAC Discussion: There was confusion as there was no Vital Statistics application. Jonathan told the Committee there would be no Vital Statistics application since this is an OSHPD data request. OSHPD gets the application for the linked file, and it is forwarded to VSAC. This is a data only project as it is adding another year of linked PDD death file.

Staff will work to identify the OSHPD data requests from the Vital Statistics request to help members with their review.

VSAC Motion: Emily Putnam-Hornstein motioned to recommend approval of the data. Jonathan Teague seconded the motion.

VSAC Vote: Jonathan Teague voted aye, David Grant voted aye, Erlinda Valdez voted aye, Emily Putnam-Hornstein voted aye and Shannon Muir voted aye voted in favor of recommending approval of the data request. There were no oppositions. Motion carried. The Committee has voted to recommend that the State Registrar approve the use of the data as described in the protocol.

The fourth project reviewed by the Committee was:

Project Title: "Tracking Development in Infants at Risk for Autism Spectrum"

Principal Investigator(s): Karen Dobkins, PhD, University of California, San Diego

Project Type: Continuing Project with Changes to the Protocol

CPHS Approval: Approved

Project No.: 12-09-0711

Expiration: December 4, 2015

File(s) Requested: 2015 Birth and Data Records obtained from San Diego County Vital Records

Requested Identifiers: Birth and Death Records (Name and Address)

Personal Contact: Yes

Identifiers Released: No

History: Previous Data Request

VSAC Discussion: The Committee and Science Advisor had concerns as to whether the requestor was requesting death data. It was clarified that Colin had contacted the requestor who said they would be requesting death data to screen out the deceased infants.

VSAC Motion: Jonathan Teague motioned to recommend approval of the data. David Grant seconded the motion.

VSAC Vote: Jonathan Teague voted aye, David Grant voted aye, Erlinda Valdez voted aye, Emily Putnam-Hornstein voted aye and Shannon Muir voted aye in favor of recommending approval of the data request. There were no oppositions. Motion carried. The Committee has voted to recommend that the State Registrar approve the use of the data as described in the protocol.

The fifth project reviewed by the Committee was:

Project Title: "The Effect of Workplace Hours Requirements on Female Occupational and Fertility Choices: Evidence from Medical Residents"

Principal Investigator(s): Melanie Wasserman, PhD Candidate, Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Project Type: New Project

CPHS Approval: Pending CPHS Approval

Project No.: 14-11-1791

Expiration: Pending CPHS Approval

File(s) Requested: 1993-2013 Birth Statistical Master File (select variable)

Requested Identifiers: BSMF (Name)

Personal Contact: No

Identifiers Released: No

History: New Data Request

VSAC Discussion: The Science Advisor stated she had a concern with the informed consent process for the project as there wasn't one. They were identifying subjects so it was brought to the Committee to see if they had that concern and the Committee would have that discussion. At the time of review, there was no CPHS letter, so it was uncertain if it was CPHS approved.

One of the Committee members felt they were not having any contact with human subjects, and it was a data only project and they were looking for a waiver of informed consent. The Science Advisor said this falls in a gray area for her as they are using individuals that are research subjects without consent even though they are not contacting them.

Henry told the Committee that CPHS approval is pending.

Jonathan commented that in the study design, once they identified the cohorts, and did the linkages, they were going to drop the names.

VSAC Motion: David Grant motioned to recommend approval of the data. Emily Putnam-Hornstein seconded the motion.

VSAC Vote: Jonathan Teague voted aye, David Grant voted aye, Erlinda Valdez voted aye, Emily Putnam-Hornstein voted aye and Shannon Muir voted aye in favor of recommending approval of the data request. There were no oppositions. Motion carried. The Committee has voted to recommend that the State Registrar approve the use of the data as described in the protocol.

The sixth project reviewed by the Committee was:

Project Title: "Normal and Abnormal Spatial Vision in Infants and Form and Motion Integration"

Principal Investigator(s): Anthony Norcia, PhD, Stanford University

Project Type: Continuing Project with Changes to the Protocol

CPHS Approval: Approved

Project No.: 12-09-0757

Expiration: December 4, 2015

File(s) Requested: 2013 Death Statistical Master File (select variables), Real-time Birth Records (January 1, 2015 – December 31, 2015)

Requested Identifiers: DSMF (Name)

Personal Contact: Yes

Identifiers Released: No

History: Previous Data Request

VSAC Discussion: There was concern expressed by the Committee regarding data destruction as it stated data destruction would follow the Stanford Data Sanitation Protocol and could not find what this was. The Committee felt it would be nice to know what the plan is for the destruction of data.

The PI would be contacted to provide information on their data destruction.

VSAC Motion: Jonathan Teague motioned to recommend approval of the data with stipulation the Stanford Data Sanitation Policy and Guidelines be attached to the protocol. Shannon Muir seconded the motion.

VSAC Vote: Jonathan Teague voted aye, David Grant voted aye, Erlinda Valdez voted aye, Emily Putnam-Hornstein voted aye and Shannon Muir voted aye in favor of recommending to the State Registrar approval of the use of the data with stipulation the Stanford Data Sanitation Policy and Guidelines be attached to the protocol. There were no oppositions. Motion carried.

The seventh project reviewed by the Committee was:

Project Title: "Development of Statewide Perinatal Quality Improvement Metrics with OSHPD PDD/Birth Certificate Linked Data"

Principal Investigator(s): Jeffrey Gould, MD, MPH, Stanford University, School of Medicine

Project Type: Continuing Project

CPHS Approval: Approved

Project No.: 12-06-0393

Expiration: July 3, 2015

File(s) Requested: 2011 OSHPD Linked PDD/Birth Data

Requested Identifiers: California identifiers

Personal Contact: No

Identifiers Released: No

History: Previous Data Request

VSAC Discussion: Jonathan pointed out this was another OSHPD data request.

VSAC Motion: Jonathan Teague motioned to recommend approval of the data. David Grant seconded the motion.

VSAC Vote: Jonathan Teague voted aye, David Grant voted aye, Erlinda Valdez voted aye, Emily Putnam-Hornstein voted aye and Shannon Muir voted aye in favor of recommending approval of the data request. There were no oppositions. Motion carried. The Committee has voted to recommend that the State Registrar approve the use of the data as described in the protocol.

The eighth project reviewed by the Committee was:

Project Title: "Arterial and Venous Thromboembolism in California: Who is at Highest Risk"

Principal Investigator(s): Richard White, MD, University of California, Davis

Project Type: Continuing Project

CPHS Approval: Approved

Project No.: 12-06-0470

Expiration: July 3, 2015

File(s) Requested: 2012 and 2013 Non-Public PDD, 2012 and 2013, Non-Public EDD, 2012 and 2013 Non-Public AS, 2011-2013 OSHPD Linked PDD/Death Data

Requested Identifiers: California identifiers

Personal Contact: No

Identifiers Released: No

History: Previous Data Request

VSAC Discussion: No Discussion

VSAC Motion: Emily Putnam-Hornstein motioned to recommend approval of the data. Jonathan Teague seconded the motion.

VSAC Vote: Jonathan Teague voted aye, David Grant voted aye, Erlinda Valdez voted aye, Emily Putnam-Hornstein voted aye and Shannon Muir voted aye in favor of recommending approval of the data request. There were no oppositions. Motion carried. The Committee has voted to recommend that the State Registrar approve the use of the data as described in the protocol.

The ninth project reviewed by the Committee was:

Project Title: "Predicting Adverse Pregnancy Outcomes Using Screening"

Principal Investigator(s): Laura Jelliffe-Pawlowski, PhD, CDPH, Genetic Disease Screening Program

Project Type: Continuing Project

CPHS Approval: Approved

Project No.: 12-09-0702

Expiration: January 4, 2016

File(s) Requested: 2011 OSHPD Linked PDD/Birth Data

Requested Identifiers: California identifiers

Personal Contact: No

Identifiers Released: No

History: Previous Data Request

VSAC Discussion: Jonathan clarified that they do not receive SSN on the birth data when they prepare the file linkages but our Patient Discharge Data does contain SSN. The SSN value to the extent they are found in the file, all derives from the hospital patient discharge data, not the birth certificate data.

VSAC Motion: Jonathan Teague motioned to recommend approval of the data. David Grant seconded the motion.

VSAC Vote: Jonathan Teague voted aye, David Grant voted aye, Erlinda Valdez voted aye, Emily Putnam-Hornstein voted aye and Shannon Muir voted aye in favor of recommending approval of the data request. There were no oppositions. Motion carried. The Committee has voted to recommend that the State Registrar approve the use of the data as described in the protocol.

The tenth project reviewed by the Committee was:

Project Title: "Life Course Social Context and Disparities in Birth Outcomes"

Principal Investigator(s): Michelle Pearl, PhD, Sequoia Foundation

Project Type: New Project

CPHS Approval: Approved

Project No.: 14-01-1466

Expiration: April 3, 2015

File(s) Requested: Requesting the approval of the use of the 1982-2011 Birth Statistical Master Files (select variables) and 1982-2011 Birth Cohort Files (select variables) from the California Biobank Program.

Requested Identifiers: BSMF (Certificate Number), Birth Cohort (Address)

Personal Contact: No

Identifiers Released: No

History: New Data Request

VSAC Discussion: David Grant told the Committee because of a conflict as he had another meeting at 9:45. He wanted to know if we had a quorum in his absence. Henry said we did. Jonathan Teague said he had to leave shortly but would hold on as long as he could as we would not have a quorum.

VSAC Motion: Shannon Muir motioned to recommend approval of the data. Jonathan Teague seconded the motion.

VSAC Vote: Jonathan Teague voted aye, Erlinda Valdez voted aye, Emily Putnam-Hornstein voted aye and Shannon Muir voted aye in favor of recommending approval of the data request. The Committee members all voted in favor of recommending approval of the data

request. There were no oppositions. Motion carried. The Committee has voted to recommend that the State Registrar approve the use of the data as described in the protocol.

The eleventh project reviewed by the Committee was:

Project Title: "Measuring the Attributable Mortality of Healthcare-Associate Infections in the United States"

Principal Investigator(s): Joelle Nadle, California Emerging Infections Program

Project Type: New Project

CPHS Approval: Approved

Project No.: 12-09-0702

Expiration: January 4, 2016

File(s) Requested: 2011 OSHPD Linked PDD/Birth Data

Requested Identifiers: California identifiers

Personal Contact: No

Identifiers Released: No

History: Previous Data Request

VSAC Discussion: No Discussion

VSAC Motion: Jonathan Teague motioned to recommend approval of the data. Emily Putnam-Hornstein seconded the motion.

VSAC Vote: Jonathan Teague voted aye, Erlinda Valdez voted aye, Emily Putnam-Hornstein voted aye and Shannon Muir voted aye in favor of recommending approval of the data request. There were no oppositions. Motion carried. The Committee has voted to recommend that the State Registrar approve the use of the data as described in the protocol.

The twelfth project reviewed by the Committee was:

Project Title: "Re-Operation on Thyroid and Parathyroid Disease in California"

Principal Investigator(s): Michael Yeh, MD, and Masha Livhits, MD, University of California, Los Angeles

Project Type: New Project

CPHS Approval: Approved

Project No.: 13-04-1170

Expiration: June 5, 2015

File(s) Requested: 2008-2011 OSHPD Linked PDD/ED/AS/Death Data, 2009-2012 Non-Public PDD, 2009-2012 Non-Public EDD, 2009-2012 AS

Requested Identifiers: California identifiers

Personal Contact: No

Identifiers Released: No

History: New Data Request

VSAC Discussion: No Discussion

VSAC Motion: Shannon Muir motioned to recommend approval of the data. Jonathan Teague seconded the motion.

VSAC Vote: Jonathan Teague voted aye, Erlinda Valdez voted aye, Emily Putnam-Hornstein voted aye and Shannon Muir voted aye in favor of recommending approval of the data request. There were no oppositions. Motion carried. The Committee has voted to recommend that the State Registrar approve the use of the data as described in the protocol.

F. ITEMS FOR DISCUSSION: Henry asked the Committee to refer to Attachment 3, Recap of Data Requests Approved in the Vital Statistics Unit.

G and H. Public Comments and AGENDA ITEMS: There were no public comments.

I. MEETING ADJOURNMENT: Jonathan Teague motioned to adjourn the meeting. Shannon Muir seconded the motion. The meeting was adjourned at 9:50 A.M.

DRAFT