

CalBRACE Indicators Feedback Webinar, 1/7/2015, 1-2PM PST

Scribe: Jacqueline Chan (CDPH) and Dorette English (CDPH)

Attendees:

- Jacqueline Chan (CDPH)
- Neil Maizlish (CDPH)
- Dorette English (CDPH)
- Paul English (CDPH)
- Brooke Sommerfeldt (CDPH)
- Karla Lopez (Imperial County)
- Michael Johnson (Merced)
- Kelly Rose (Merced)
- Robert Hernandez (Tulare)
- Kathleen Karle (San Luis Obispo)
- Judy Robinson (Sacramento Office of Sustainability)
- John Kaufman (Contra Costa)
- Jennifer Black (Shasta)
- Nicole Bonkrude (Shasta)
- Karen Olsen (Sacramento)
- Matt Wolff (San Francisco)
- Kristin Barrera (San Francisco)
- Paula Kriner (Imperial)
- Jose Ruiz-Salas (Tulare)
- Andrew Deckert (Shasta County)
- Shelley Saitowitz (San Diego)

Meeting Notes:

- Neil Maizlish (CDPH) provided background on framework and indicators and stated focus today is how valuable is this data and how these data might fit into valuable work that counties have already underway.
- Shelley Saitowitz (San Diego): Is interested in a data source for K-12 schools with air conditioning.
 - Neil Maizlish (CDPH): Location of data for school facilities would be available through the CA Department of Education.
- Judy Robinson (Sacramento): Sacramento Metropolitan Air Quality Management District may have more current and relevant data than CalEnviroScreen. Would this be considered to be added as data source?
 - Neil Maizlish (CDPH): Depends on how CDPH would partner with local counties to obtain data easily. We don't have resources to do that for 58 counties. We do want as current as possible data.
 - Paul English (CDPH): There may be an issue with consistency of methodologies. CalEnviroScreen used a standard methodology for the entire state that local data may not adhere to.

1) *Do your Department or key stakeholders routinely use a different indicator for the climate risk or vulnerability we are trying to assess? How are they already being used?*

- Michael Johnson (Merced): In Office of Emergency Services, we do look at heat index and cooling centers to identify at risk communities for cooling center

activation planning. Heat measures do not reference humidity which seems to be an important element of the heat index.

- Neil Maizlish (CDPH): It is important. FOLLOW UP --> look at whether heat index data is available
- Paul English (CDPH): In California humidity has historically not been a big factor. However, the heat wave in 2006 was associated with a humid air mass. Researchers at Scripps institute and NOAA are considering that humidity may be a possible risk factor in the future. We may consider having a heat index.
- Michael Johnson (Merced): Why is vector-borne diseases data not included as an indicator? Or infectious diseases?
 - Neil Maizlish (CDPH): Vector-borne diseases was not considered as a priority at the start of the project due to capacity issues. Many eastern BRACE states are looking at vector-borne diseases.
 - Paul English (CDPH): The condition of Valley Fever might be more specific to California and San Joaquin Valley where it is endemic in places.
- Neil: Are the indicators useful or aligned with your needs for health needs assessments?
- Paula Kriner (Imperial): Yes, we are looking at these types of indicators- looking at how we can take a more in depth look at vulnerability. Health status report included similar indicators. We are looking into including more of these things in the future.
 - Neil Maizlish (CDPH): If we mirrored these, would that duplicate or be value added?
 - Paula Kriner (Imperial): It would add value. We're not at a point where we can decide which ones. These indicators represent issues for our communities.
- Karen Olsen (Sacramento): Health status report was recently updated. The use of vulnerability and social indicators was limited. I will have to see how this might dovetail with accreditation here.
- Neil: In updates of general plans, and planning focused on health equity and climate issues-are these of potential interest for any of your partners.
- Judy Robinson (Sacramento): Community development and transportation has been working with public health department to work on active transportation design and built environment issues to change how community and infrastructure design can improve air quality and safety. We included policy in housing element addressing food security and healthy design around the Healthy Communities Initiative. We are bringing health into more of the other departments as well as SACOG, AQ. We are looking at the vulnerability assessment and BRACE grant

in hopes of developing a larger vulnerability assessment effort including the other sectors. We would like to get more input from you to guide our direction. Share data and get data to justify more improved transportation and community building.

2) Do you have alternative suggestions for indicators described in the list? What are they, what data do they use, and why do you think they would be better than the recommended indicator? What are the challenges to using indicators?

- Michael Johnson (Merced): National Weather Service Drought Monitor
 - Neil Maizlish (CDPH): We'll look into it to see if projections are available at finer geographies. FOLLOW UP. This keeps coming up and we might be interested in how drought disrupts food security.
 - Michael Johnson (Merced): Interaction between public health and other sectors right now is focused on addressing water management, scarcity and drought issues.
- Jennifer Black (Shasta): We use OSHPD data to look at ER visits and use death certificate data to look at deaths related to heat. Is this the same as CDPH?
 - Neil Maizlish (CDPH): Yes. This is the same data source (we are using). Other BRACE states may also be a resource. Eastern BRACE states are using SNOMED data source.
 - Paula Kriner: We use ED data in Imperial County for heat illnesses.

3) Are there key indicators that you think need to be added?

(no responses)

4) How have you used or how do you intend to use these indicators? Who in your community or within your organization use or would use indicators?

- Shelley Saitowitz (San Diego): Through 1422 Prevention Grant, we will be conducting active transportation and pedestrian planning. This data would help us find target areas initially and highlight specific vulnerabilities related to heat or pollution, and how they might influence pedestrian use environment and what kind of projects or designs to prioritize.
- Michael Johnson (Merced): We have ongoing dialogue with several communities in the chronic disease area talking about project opportunity and chronic diseases. 1) If we brought these detailed vulnerability data, it would probably have some impact on how they would design. 2) We would incorporate it into community planning process and for accreditation. 3) Merced City Climate C Plan project is interested in seeing our public health information to see how it is helpful to their planning efforts as well.

- Neil Maizlish (CDPH): Would race/ethnicity stratification and stratification at smaller geographies help with equity issues in your community? Does this add value to how questions of health equity are addressed through data?
- Shelley Saitowitz (San Diego): Yes it would add value.
- Neil: How useful is this data? What about heat contingency maps?
- Paula Kriner (Imperial): We do have a heat response emergency preparedness policy and we do a heat report during peak season where we monitor heat related deaths and temperatures. This would be very useful. We open cooling centers in summer months. This would help us target the locations where they are most valuable especially for vulnerable populations with limited access to public transit.
- Neil Maizlish (CDPH): For cooling centers - would it add value to geocode locations of facilities with sensitive populations? Might be possible with ten partner LHD but not likely for all 58 counties.
- Paula Kriner (Imperial): Sure.
- Karen Olsen (Sacramento): If cooling stations and warming centers could be linked to where there are concentrations of homeless people, that would be useful.
- Neil Maizlish (CDPH): Do you have data on where homeless people are located and how geographically refined is it?
- Karen (Sacramento): Unsure. I will look into it.
- Paula Kriner (Imperial): That is intriguing. We have a local homeless task force and they do an annual count. That would be worth looking at and it's a great idea. I'm not sure how drilled down the data is.
- Paul English (CDPH): That data is not in the ACS. It is a one day census.
- Neil Maizlish (CDPH): In my experience with Berkeley and Alameda, the local count is more detailed than US census.
- Paul English (CDPH): With the cooling centers, it may be interesting for counties to have average walk time to cooling centers.
- Judy Robinson (Sacramento): Maps with heating and cooling centers, and location of various medical clinics or health centers as a backup for hospitals would be helpful as part of the mapping.
- Neil Maizlish (CDPH): OSHPD has that data and we can look at how complete the data is. We can consider adding it to the map data. FOLLOW UP.

5) In addition to data files to produce color-shaded maps of census tracts, would you also like a map layer with locations of sensitive populations like skilled nursing facilities, prisons and K-12 schools for your jurisdiction?

- Andrew Deckert (Shasta): Mapping sensitive populations has added value politically to show the human people behind all these efforts. Many mappings would follow population densities so how much work is needed for added value. For heat waves – mapping people without air conditioning is of great value. Swamp coolers are not cutting it. Is there a way to map lack of air conditioning?
- Neil Maizlish (CDPH): It is very hard. We are using RAST data. I don't think we'll be able to get that kind of data- not geographically fine. American housing survey is big geographically.
- Shelley Saitowitz (San Diego): We are interested in children in K-12 schools that lack air conditioning. Schools have had to close down during high heat.
- Neil Maizlish (CDPH): Contact the Department of Education to see if that data is available through facilities. FOLLOW UP.
- Andrew Deckert (Shasta): Heat waves combined with power outages were deadly in previous heat waves. Is there a way to map frequency of power outage by area?
- Neil Maizlish (CDPH): We can look into it. FOLLOW UP.

6) What are your thoughts about a vulnerability index which pools over several indicators? How would you use them?

- Paul English (CDPH) explained how the index works. Exceptions he notes included the need for ground truthing and that validation issues could come up.
- Shelley Saitowitz (San Diego): I support CDPH pursuing and it would provide a good starting point for starting a conversation with partners. Cities are already planning and may not be talking about this.
- Karen Olsen (Sacramento): Research about CDC creating a heat index in Georgia. From a planning perspective, I found it interesting and useful.
- Unknown Speaker: This might be useful for climate action plan.

Next Steps presented by Neil Maizlish (CDPH):

- We will continue working on these indicators.
- Data will be used for Climate and Health Profile Report and Vulnerability Report
 - We will send out Climate and Health Profile Report draft to see if there are any more comments.
- Case stories of climate change activities of California local public health departments will be posted on website soon.
- Inventory template – Request for volunteers willing to help to create inventory of climate activities in your area? We have format and would like some volunteers to test this out.
- Webinar evaluation survey will be emailed to you.