**Office of Health Equity Advisory Committee Meeting**

**Meeting Minutes (DRAFT Staff Notes)**

**May 18, 2017**

Sierra Health Foundation

1321 Garden Highway

Sacramento, CA 95833

# OHE-AC Members Participating:

Rye Baerg, MA-URP

Dalila Butler, MPH, Chair

Rocco Cheng, PhD

Donnell Ewert, MPH

Lisa Folberg, MPP

Aaron Fox, MPM, Vice Chair

Sandi Gálvez, MSW

Álvaro Garza, MD, MPH

Carrie Johnson, PhD

Jo-Ann Julien, BA, MEd

Manel Kappagoda, JD, MPH

Nahla Kayali

Jan King, MD, MPH

Dexter Louie, MD, JD, MPA

Yvette McShan

Lloyd Nadal, MA

Hermia Parks, MA, RN, PHN

Linda Wheaton, MURP, AICP

Michael Witte, MD

# Members Absent:

Sergio Aguilar-Gaxiola, MD, PhD

Alison Chopel, DrPH, MPH

Guillermo Gonzalez, MPP

Sylvia Kim, JD, MSt

Denise Middlebrook, PhD

# State Officials/Staff:

Jahmal Miller, MHA, OHE Deputy Director

Tamu Nolfo, PhD, Senior Project Manager, OHE

Dante Allen, MCM, Senior Communications Officer, OHE

Dulce Bustamante-Zamora, PhD, Research Scientist III, OHE

Ricky Cleere, CDPH, OHE, CalBRACE, Climate Change and Health Equity program, CivicSpark Fellow

Noralee Cole, SSA, OHE

Claudia Crist, RN, FACHE, Chief Deputy Director, Policy and Programs, California Department of Public Health

Carol Gomez, AGPA, OHE

Solange Gould, DrPH, MPH, Policy Unit Chief, OHE

Jennifer Hernandez, Associate Secretary for Farmworker and Immigrant Services, California Labor and Workforce Development Agency

Benjamin Hicks, MPH, HRSU, OHE

Laura Leonelli, MA, Health Program Specialist I, CDEU, OHE

Frank Molina, Climate Change and Health Equity, OHE

Dahir Nasser, MPH, Health Program Specialist I, HiAP, OHE

Marisa Ramos, PhD, Chief, Office of Refugee Health, CDPH

Terica Thomas, CDPH Fusion Center

Dan Torres, Director, Governor's Office of Immigrant Integration

Daniel Woo, MPH, AGPA, Policy Unit, OHE

# Speakers from the Public:

Melissa Brown, Graduate Student, University of California, Berkeley, School of Public Health

Gladis Chavez, Graduate Student, University of California, Berkeley, School of Public Health

Shirley Darling

Liz Derias-Tyehimba, Greenlining Institute

Mark Freeman

Christopher Galeano, Policy Associate, California Immigrant Policy Center

Gabriel Garcia

Melissa Jones, MPA, Executive Director, Bay Area Regional Health Inequities Initiative

Patricia Lee, PhD, OHE-AC member (teleconference)

Jae Maldonado, MPA, Executive Director, Street Level Health

Liz Oseguera, Deputy Director of Government Affairs, California Primary Care Association

Isabel Rangel Ramirez, Graduate Student, University of California, Berkeley, School of Public Health

Tamara

Celina Torres, Administrator for the Migrant Program, California Department of Education (teleconference)

Joseph Villela, Policy Director, Coalition for Humane Immigrant Rights of Los Angeles

Rachel Vizcarra, Programs Coordinator, United Farm Workers Foundation

Nkauj Iab Yang, California Director of Programs and Policy, Southeast Asia Resource Action Center

Astrid Zamora, Graduate Student, University of California, Berkeley, School of Public Health

AC Attendees in Person:Rye Baerg, MA-URP, Dalila Butler, MPH, Chair, Rocco Cheng, PhD, Donnell Ewert, MPH, Lisa Folberg, MPP, Aaron Fox, MPM, Vice Chair,

Sandi Gálvez, MSW, Álvaro Garza, MD, MPH, Carrie Johnson, PhD, Jo-Ann Julien, BA, MEd Manel Kappagoda, JD, MPH, Nahla Kayali, Jan King, MD, MPH, Dexter Louie, MD, JD, MPA, Yvette McShan, Lloyd Nadal, MA, Hermia Parks, MA, RN, PHN,

Linda Wheaton, MURP, AICP, Michael Witte, MD

## 10:00 a.m. Convene Meeting and Welcome | Roll Call | Agenda Review | Meeting Minutes

Dalila Butler, MPH, Chair of the Office of Health Equity (OHE) Advisory Committee (AC), called the OHE-AC meeting to order, welcomed everyone, and asked the OHE-AC members to introduce themselves. She provided a brief overview of the OHE-AC meeting agenda.

Chair Butler welcomed new OHE-AC member Jo-Ann Julien and asked her to introduce herself.

Report from the Chair

Chair Butler thanked OHE-AC members for providing feedback on the Statewide Housing Assessment updates presented at the last meeting. She stated a letter incorporating that feedback was sent to the California Department of Housing and Community Development (HCD) and was included in today’s meeting packet.

Chair Butler stated most OHE-AC members attended the California Department of Public Health (CDPH) Advancing Prevention in the 21st Century (P21) 2.0 Conference, which was about advances in the Let’s Get Healthy California work. She shared information about the workshops and panels and noted that Dr. Karen Smith, MD, MPH, the Director of the CDPH and the State Health Officer, recognized Jahmal Miller, MHA, the OHE Deputy Director, as the Ambassador for Health Equity throughout California.

**Motion: February 6, 2017, Meeting Minutes**

Yvette McShan made a motion to approve the February 6, 2017, Meeting Minutes, as presented.

***(Motion made).***

**Vote**: Motion carried 13 yes, 0 no, and 4 abstain, per roll call vote as follows:

The following OHE-AC members voted “Yes”: Chair Butler, Vice Chair Fox, and Committee members Baerg, Ewert, Folberg, Garza, Kayali, Kappagoda, King, Louie, McShan, Nadal, and Witte.

The following OHE-AC members abstained: Committee members Galvez, Johnson, Julien, and Parks.

## 10:30 a.m. Policy Landscape

**Presenter:**

Christopher Galeano, Policy Associate, California Immigrant Policy Center (CIPC)

Christopher Galeano, Policy Associate, CIPC, discussed the mission, goals, and objectives of the CIPC. He provided an overview, accompanied by a slide presentation, of the political landscape and its potential impact on Californians, the Health4All Kids program, and the future Health4All Young Adults budget proposal. He encouraged the support of Senate Bill (SB) 54, the California Values Act, and stated the need to protect, preserve, and advance immigrant health in California.

Mr. Galeano invited everyone to the Health4All Lobby Conference and Rally on Sunday and Monday to lift up the Health4All proposal and other measures.

**Questions and Discussion**

Alvaro Garza, MD, MPH, asked about the prognosis of the passage of SB 54 and if it requires counties to put out welcoming information for immigrants. Mr. Galeano stated he is confident, with additional work on the language, that the bill will get to the governor’s office. The CIPC is collaborating with the governor’s office, the Assembly, and partners to ensure that concerns are addressed. The safe space provision ensures a uniform policy statewide for county providers and health facilities to display welcoming informational signs.

Manel Kappagoda, JD, MPH, asked about the research behind the statement that cutting the tie between the U.S. Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) and local law enforcement increases public safety. Mr. Galeano stated he will forward the research reports to staff.

Nahla Kayali stated her organization is part of Health4All. She stated the challenge that some parents refuse to share their income because they are undocumented. She asked if other organizations and populations are experiencing the same enrollment challenge. Mr. Galeano stated he will forward the question to the Health Policy Coordinator, who has more information on enrollment challenges.

Michael Witte, MD, stated 10 to 15 percent of patients at federally qualified health centers are not showing up for appointments out of fear of ICE or of having to repay the public charge, which puts communities at risk of sickness and disease.

Hermia Parks, MA, RN, PHN, stated Riverside County is experiencing similar issues, especially in the Coachella Valley area. She asked which policy center Riverside County should access for additional information. Mr. Galeano stated the Los Angeles center is the closest. He stated the CIPC is always looking for stories from clients that uplift and make this issue real to the Legislature and the governor.

Donnell Ewert, MPH, stated the understanding that most undocumented immigrants are individuals who have overstayed their Visas. He asked if the CIPC talks about who the undocumented immigrants are. He asked how the North American Free Trade Agreement (NAFTA) impacts immigration. Mr. Galeano stated the CIPC serves all immigrants in California regardless of immigration status. NAFTA and other trade policies have played a role in shaping the immigrants who come to the United States but it is not something that the CIPC focuses on and does not inform the work on a statewide level.

Carrie Johnson, PhD, stated her agency works with many Native American families who experience stresses related to documentation. These stresses can lead to them refusing services. Mr. Galeano agreed that these communities need reassurance that their information will not be released.

Lloyd Nadal, MA, asked about support for SB 54 from local law enforcement. Mr. Galeano stated the CIPC has been working with law enforcement and received a letter of support on the bill from the Santa Cruz sheriff. Law enforcement agencies throughout California do not want to do immigration enforcement work; their primary goal is to promote the public safety of their communities.

Chair Butler asked about over-policing and arresting immigrants with no criminal convictions. She asked how to shift the conversation and influence legislation to prevent negative impacts. Mr. Galeano stated it is important not to give into the good immigrant/bad immigrant narrative because it is rooted in racism and discrimination. Education and language are important to changing perspectives on these issues, which also affect refugees.

Sandi Galvez, MSW, asked if discussions are going on to find long-term strategies against over-policing and the good versus bad immigrant mindset. She stated the need for more partnerships and coalition-building across sectors to address the broader issues of civil liberties and safety, and to speak out against over-criminalization of communities of color and the devaluation of certain populations. Mr. Galeano stated that is what the CIPC does and it encourages others to do that, as well.

Deputy Director Miller suggested collaborating with members of the law enforcement community that presented at the December meeting in trying to identify how to advance discussion on the criminalization issue that affects immigrants and the mentally ill. Mr. Galeano stated legislators often do not take the implications on policies and communities into account when looking at bills. The CIPC strives to educate legislators on the way they look at and make decisions on bills.

**Public Comment**

Mark Freeman asked how the state will ensure the implementation of SB 54 when some law enforcement agencies are partnered with ICE. Mr. Galeano stated the Trust and Truth Acts, passed in 2013 and 2016, require transparency and accountability. Also, advocates, such as the Trust Act Implementation Coalition, monitor counties to ensure that they are abiding by state law.

Liz Oseguera, Deputy Director of Government Affairs, California Primary Care Association (CPCA), stated the CPCA is developing model policies and procedures as stated in SB 54 to help clinics prepare for ICE raids, and an immigrant resource page to help inform clinics of their rights. She offered to work with Mr. Galeano on these issues.

Ms. Oseguera stated some counties require clinics to gather immigration status information through the enrollment process. She asked if SB 244 could be used as a vehicle to ensure that clinics are not required to maintain this information for the mandated five years. She offered to collaborate with the CIPC to address this issue. Mr. Galeano asked for Ms. Oseguera’s contact information so he could forward her comments to the CIPC.

## 11:10 a.m. Communities: The View from the Grassroots

**Presenters:**

Jae Maldonado, MPA, Executive Director, Street Level Health

Joseph Villela, Policy Director, Coalition for Humane Immigrant Rights of Los Angeles

Rachel Vizcarra, Programs Coordinator, United Farm Workers Foundation

Nkauj Iab Yang, California Director of Programs and Policy, Southeast Asia Resource Action Center

Chair Butler deferred to Ms. Kayali to facilitate this agenda item.

Ms. Kayali introduced the members of the panel, who will discuss the work that advocacy groups and nonprofit organizations are doing in the communities.

Jae Maldonado

Jae Maldonado, MPA, Executive Director, Street Level Health (SLH), discussed the mission, goals, and objectives of Street Level Health. He highlighted the current work of SLH, such as partnering with UC Berkeley and Health Care for the Homeless to use a mobile van to treat individuals where they are. SLH advocates at the county level for increased language access and uplifts the narrative of the changing demographic of the Bay Area, the need for mild to moderate mental health services and prevention, and immigrant health and employment issues. SLH research has found that large numbers of clients have post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD), which is triggered by anti-immigrant sentiment received upon arrival to the United States and increased by general stress related to lack of community, family, and resources. One of the largest challenges is the lack of data on immigrant issues. He stated the need to consider how community health centers can be a triage point to help clients who are experiencing trauma to receive mild to moderate mental health services.

Ms. Kayali asked how many of the immigrants SLH serves are refugees and the average number of years they have been in the United States. Mr. Maldonado stated 15 percent of them are refugees and the average time is under three years.

Joseph Villela

Joseph Villela, Policy Director, Coalition for Humane Immigrant Rights of Los Angeles (CHIRLA), discussed the mission, goals, and objectives of the CHIRLA. The CHIRLA advocates at the federal, state, and local levels and organizes immigrants using a family model to effect systematic change. He discussed the current executive orders that pertain to immigrants, how they are being implemented, and ways to react to them, such as civic engagement. He stated the CHIRLA is sponsoring 10 state bills this year related to immigrants.

Rachel Vizcarra

Rachel Vizcarra, Programs Coordinator, United Farm Workers Foundation (UFWF), discussed the mission, goals, and objectives of the UFWF. The UFWF is a direct service organization providing legal services to help individuals navigate the immigration system and screening of health partnerships and to help clinics and human service agencies better understand the qualifications for and coverage of health services. She agreed with the previous speaker that the current climate makes it difficult to encourage members of the immigrant community to show up for medical appointments, participate in government, and speak out. She stated approximately half of the immigrants in California are naturalized citizens. She cautioned against sharing good versus bad immigrant stories for the safety of undocumented family members.

Nkauj Iab Yang

Nkauj Iab Yang, California Director of Programs and Policy, Southeast Asia Resource Action Center (SARAC), discussed the mission, goals, and objectives of the SARAC. The SARAC is a national civil rights organization that addresses issues of health, immigration, and education. She agreed with the previous speakers that immigrants suffer increased mental health issues, such as PTSD and depression. She stated data equity is important. More data is required to show the health and education disparities that exist in immigrant communities and the number of immigrants who are in the criminal justice system. She asked the OHE to support data equity and to consider alternative ways to put more funding into immigrant communities for culturally, linguistically, and age-appropriate services, and to invest in workforce development.

**Questions and Discussion**

Dr. Garza asked if members of the panel work with sending countries to help educate friends and families there. Ms. Vizcarra stated the UFWF does not but has a strong relationship with several consulates to learn about services the sending countries can assist with. Mr. Villela stated the same for the CHIRLA. Ms. Yang stated the Southeast Asian repatriation agreements are different and there is no accountability.

Rocco Cheng, PhD, stated disaggregated data is important. He stated the challenges of retaining employees once they are trained and licensed and of acquiring government-provided funding for Southeast Asian communities. Ms. Yang suggested encouraging agencies to partner with community-based organizations to ensure that research reflects the community and that it comes from a community perspective.

Ms. Kappagoda asked what the OHE-AC could do to help. Mr. Villela asked for help in ensuring that agencies at the state level continue to serve low-income communities, including immigrant communities. Ms. Vizcarra agreed and asked for help with education and training through internal memos and guidance. Mr. Maldonado asked for help in reviewing county health budgets to ensure they are representative based on specific county populations and are created to respond to changing demographics. Ms. Yang agreed with the previous suggestions and added asking for support in making community more visible - for example, translating the Know Your Rights resources into Southeast Asian languages - and being creative to ensure that different levels of media reach the communities. This past Saturday, the SARAC hosted the First Southeast Asian Immigration Know Your Rights Community Forum in the Fresno area. She stated the importance of disseminating information in verbal and written translations.

Linda Wheaton, MURP, AICP, stated it would be interesting to know the extent to which the CDPH already is providing that kind of information. Deputy Director Miller stated a representative from the CDPH and agency partners are scheduled to present later in the agenda.

**Public Comment**

Liz Derias-Tyehimba, Greenlining Institute, agreed with the need for data equity and disaggregating data and how important that is for communities, particularly the Arab and Southwest Asian communities that do not have much data about their health needs although they are represented in 56 of the 58 California counties.

## 12:00 p.m. Lunch Break

## 12:30 p.m. Portrait of Promise: The California Statewide Plan to Promote Health and Mental Health Equity Implementation Update

**Presenters:**

Melissa Brown, Graduate Student, University of California, Berkeley, School of Public Health

Gladis Chavez, Graduate Student, University of California, Berkeley, School of Public Health

Isabel Rangel Ramirez, Graduate Student, University of California, Berkeley, School of Public Health

Astrid Zamora, Graduate Student, University of California, Berkeley, School of Public Health

Tamu Nolfo, PhD, OHE Special Consultant, stated the OHE had an opportunity to apply to be a part of the class that UC Berkeley offers through its School of Public Health to be a Field Study Placement Site for a group of students in the class to help implement the 31 goals of the Portrait of Promise, particularly an assessment goal to better understand what was happening at the local level around the social determinants of health - how planning was happening in that space and what implementation of the social determinants of health look like at the local level. The OHE proposed hosting a team of students to walk them through that process and provide the work on that goal.

Gladis Chavez

Gladis Chavez, Graduate Student, University of California, Berkeley, School of Public Health, provided an overview, accompanied by a slide presentation, of the background of the project and health equity in California. The students conducted a needs assessment, which was directly tied to the Portrait of Promise goal: identify how communities and local health departments are mobilizing to address the social determinants of health in California.

Isabel Rangel Ramirez

Isabel Rangel Ramirez, Graduate Student, University of California, Berkeley, School of Public Health, provided an overview, accompanied by a slide presentation, of the public health framework for reducing health inequities and the target population of eight county health departments for the needs assessment conducted by the students as part of the Portrait of Promise goal. She suggested ways that health care agencies can respond to the current political climate and recommended Human Impact Partners as a resource.

Melissa Brown

Melissa Brown, Graduate Student, University of California, Berkeley, School of Public Health, provided an overview, accompanied by a slide presentation, of the process, methods, and data review for the needs assessment conducted by the students as part of the Portrait of Promise goal.

Astrid Zamora

Astrid Zamora, Graduate Student, University of California, Berkeley, School of Public Health, provided an overview, accompanied by a slide presentation, of the findings and major themes of the needs assessment conducted by the students as part of the Portrait of Promise goal. She stated the three common themes were access to health care, the built environment, and safety.

**Questions and Discussion**

Ms. Parks asked what it was like to learn about the data and what the county was doing in the areas where the students grew up.

* Ms. Brown stated it was eye-opening. She stated she was excited to hear about the work that Alameda County is doing around the social determinants of health and felt a sense of pride in her county for being considered a leading county in the health equity effort.
* Ms. Zamora stated, although Kern County has not received enough funding for health issues for many years, residents are coming together in collective efficacy projects, which shows that residents care about their community. She stated she has remained in contact with the county and is interested in what else is being accomplished there.
* Ms. Ramirez stated her passion for public health and social justice stems from experiences she had growing up in Mexico and immigrating to Fresno County. This project was a reiteration of the pride she has in her community and how invested she is in growing as a public health professional so she can go back and work with the community she came from to help overcome cultural and linguistic barriers. She stated she liked gathering the success stories best because often these communities are seen in a deficit perspective.
* Ms. Chavez stated going through the data and the community health improvement plan and finding that Orange County is addressing public health issues and legal and political forces of the current political climate was interesting. She stated she and her family experienced barriers in accessing health care as immigrants. She stated she would like to join in the community organizing that is happening or the efforts being done by the local health department because there is still more work to be done to address these issues and how they continue to impact immigrants in Orange County.

Dr. Garza asked to what extent the counties work with other agencies besides health. Ms. Brown stated the presentation given today is only a small snapshot of the research the students did on this project. She offered to send Dr. Garza the full 22-page report. All counties researched were invested in collaborations and partnerships.

## 1:10 p.m. The Health Field: California Department of Public Health (CDPH) and Local Health Departments

**Presenters:**

Claudia Crist, RN, FACHE, Chief Deputy Director, Policy and Programs, CDPH

Melissa Jones, MPA, Executive Director, Bay Area Regional Health Inequities Initiative (BARHII)

Jahmal Miller, MHA, OHE Deputy Director, CDPH

Marisa Ramos, PhD, Chief, Office of Refugee Health, CDPH

Jahmal Miller

Deputy Director Miller stated all the work out of the OHE is multisectoral and multifaceted and affects geographically, racially, and ethnically diverse groups in uniquely different ways. He stated he feels a great deal of pride in the power in this room because there are not many state-sponsored convenings like this that are action-oriented and address serious issues.

Deputy Director Miller discussed a universal effort and reflection of the significant progress being made in the CDPH to address racism, discrimination, and bigotry throughout political systems, government institutions, and society in general. There is a movement underway within the OHE to build up the internal capacity of the CDPH to address racial and health equity in a substantive and meaningful way through a more intellectually and demographically diverse workforce. Everyone has a unique role to play to achieve health and mental health equity across the state of California.

Deputy Director Miller highlighted the work of the 35 grantees of the California Reducing Disparities Project. Approximately 60 percent of the grantees focus on addressing the needs of immigrants and refugee communities.

Claudia Crist

Claudia Crist, RN, FACHE, Chief Deputy Director, Policy and Programs, CDPH, discussed what she is hearing about immigrant, refugee, and migrant health; and key programs being implemented around those populations. The CDPH is looking internally first to uncover biases. Much of every program within the CDPH touches on immigrant, refugee, and migrant health to some degree. She stated the CDPH did Community Assessments for Public Health Response (CASPHR), which are done in response to public health emergencies, in the Central Valley as related to the drought and the impacts on migrant workers, who make up the majority of that population. She stated the CDPH partners with the OHE to look at opportunities, gap assessments of how to address equity, and how to do it better.

Marisa Ramos

Marisa Ramos, PhD, Chief, California Office of Refugee Health (ORH), CDPH, stated the ORH partners with local health providers and volunteer resettlement agencies to provide culturally and linguistically appropriate comprehensive health assessments and health services to newly-arrived refugees.

Melissa Jones

Melissa Jones, MPA, Executive Director, Bay Area Regional Health Inequities Initiative (BARHII), stated the BARHII was founded to focus on health equity issues. She stated they do a series of interventions including policy work and analysis to better understand the impacts of policies on health for different populations. Ms. Jones provided an overview, accompanied by a slide presentation, of the rapidly changing policy context and the goals, limitations, responses, and results of the Rapid Response Survey: Health Impacts of Federal Immigration Policy, which will help inform internal practice and policy advocacy.

Ms. Jones shared suggestions that the CDPH and others can do, based on research data:

* Think clearly about what can be done to support mental health providers.
* Identify willing public safety partners for local health departments.
* Assist counties in putting out welcoming communications to clients and clear communications to staff on rights and responsibilities around continuing to serve immigrant populations.
* Put pressure on counties to continue service to immigrant populations.

**Questions and Discussion**

Ms. Parks asked if public health nursing or outreach workers were part of the survey. Ms. Jones stated all respondents worked directly with clients.

Aaron Fox, MPM, Vice Chair of the OHE-AC suggested that the CDPH and others review their forms, especially eligibility and enrollment forms, for questions about citizenship that will not create a barrier to services. Ms. Jones stated it would be helpful to have a list for local health departments of which programs need to know about citizenship and which do not. Ms. Crist suggested going through all forms to consider why each question is asked, whether they can be asked differently, and if they are necessary.

Chair Butler asked about the latitude of the CDPH and the BARHII to discuss general practices that are happening across agencies that impact immigrants to prevent mental health and stress issues from the beginning. Deputy Director Miller stated the CDPH is looking internally to model the way to change the culture and mindset and is providing technical assistance and training to local health jurisdictions. Ms. Crist stated there is a close connection between the CDPH and local health officers and jurisdictions; various departments get together every month to discuss crosscutting issues.

Mr. Ewert asked if anyone is working on a campaign to highlight contributions that immigrants make in California. Dr. Ramos stated the International Rescue Committee, a resettlement agency, has a national campaign that shows data on the contributions of refugees to communities. Ms. Jones stated the Day Without Immigrants tries to highlight contributions. She stated it would be easier for different localities to get materials up in different departments if a state agency put out communications materials.

Dr. Garza suggested getting welcoming communications materials in Valley counties because of the political environment.

**Public Comment**

Ms. Yang asked Ms. Jones if there was a similar report for the Central Valley. Ms. Jones stated there is not. She offered to share the tool with Ms. Yang.

Mr. Freeman asked how the BARHII is working with local school districts, school nurses, and social/emotional learning staff because many times they are the front line of dealing with childhood trauma in schools. Ms. Jones stated the difficulty of this time is that individuals are relying on existing relationships. In many places, it has been hard for individuals to form relationships with schools, but they would do it if they could figure out how.

Ms. Derias-Tyehimba asked if most refugees come as families or individuals and what the process is for reunification because that is important to mental health. Dr. Ramos stated most families are brought over as a family unit.

Tamara stated she collaborated with colleagues across the nation in March to gather immigrants to ask them for a word, phrase, and symbol that would convey safety that can be adopted by health care providers. She stated there are two designs that are available at the Stand with All Patients website.

Jo-Ann Julien stated the need for alternative ways to get messages out besides hosting events. She suggested technology such as video chat or online webinars.

## 2:00 p.m. Break

## 2:10 p.m. Health Partners: The Broader State Response

**Presenters:**

Jennifer Hernandez, Associate Secretary for Farmworker and Immigrant Services, California Labor and Workforce Development Agency

Celina Torres, Administrator for the Migrant Program, California Department of Education

Dan Torres, Director, Governor’s Office of Immigrant Integration

Dan Torres

Dan Torres, Director, Governor’s Office of Immigrant Integration, stated the vision behind his newly-created role is to help bring a new lens to state government around immigrant integration and to bring agencies and departments together to think about how to help immigrants become part of the fabric and value their contributions. He discussed shifts toward defensive policies and services over the past six months for immigrant protection so individuals can feel confident in the programs and fully utilize them.

Jennifer Hernandez

Jennifer Hernandez, Associate Secretary for Farmworker and Immigrant Services, California Labor and Workforce Development Agency (LWDA), stated she focuses on serving farm workers and immigrant integration. She discussed the current work of the LWDA, such as a cross-training and information sharing for outreach to staff and partner agencies to increase understanding and better align programs that serve farm workers and fill in gaps, releasing new messaging that an individual’s legal status does not matter, partnering with the UCLA Labor Center to develop training materials and a guide on how to deliver services in a culturally and linguistically appropriate way to the indigenous and immigrant communities to be shared with other state departments, and launching the English Language Learner and Immigrant Workforce Navigator Pilot Program.

Celina Torres

Celina Torres, Administrator for the Migrant Program, English Learner Support Division, California Department of Education (CDE), stated many of the issues discussed by the other presenters are the same issues heard with migrant families. She noted that not all migrant families are immigrants. The Migrant Program is a federally-funded supplemental education program that provides tutoring and intervention services, but also is mandated to address the health needs of students, which are dental and vision screenings and referrals to social service agencies and services. She stated there has been a recent increase in the demand for referrals for mental health services. The migrant program has strong parent and networking components that regularly reach out to families. Ms. Torres stated the superintendent has sent out messages encouraging schools to declare themselves as safe havens. The Migrant Program works with the Mexican Consulate to disseminate information they provide, and has developed a strong relationship with families and gained their trust. She referred to the Migrant Education Program information sheets that contain further information about the Migrant Program, which was included in the meeting packet.

**Questions and Discussion**

Ms. Kappagoda asked how departments are preparing and coordinating in the event they are required to turn over their data. Mr. Torres stated his organization is taking a deeper look at that. One of the complexities is there are programs that are federally funded that may require data sharing with the federal government. Other programs are state funded where there is no reason to ask immigration or citizenship status, and counties and agencies are asking whether they even need to ask those questions.

Dr. Garza asked if Mr. Torres has a report that looks at the 22 state departments, their policies, and programs regarding immigrants and improving their lives. Mr. Torres stated there have been discussions about identifying what is out there and what is helping immigrants. Mr. Torres stated one of the initiatives his organization is moving forward with is an online clearinghouse of programs that will be launched this summer. He provided a handout of organizations that his organization currently funds through state contracts that are doing immigration-related work.

Dr. Garza shared a poem that he wrote 15 years ago, called *Frontera Life/Border Vida*. It is posted on the website.

**Public Comment**

Gabriel Garcia asked how to ensure that the administration does not adhere to the good versus bad immigrant narrative when deciding who is worthy or deserving of seeking relief under these programs and what advocates can do. Mr. Torres stated this issue needs to be discussed.

Patricia Lee, PhD, OHE-AC member, provided updated numbers about SB 75 and the transition of undocumented children under the age of 19. She stated there is a website with more information on SB 75 and what Medi-Cal has done with breakdowns by county. The Department of Health Care Services (DHCS) is working to post current numbers on their website.

## 3:00 p.m. Recommendations to the State

Chair Butler asked OHE-AC members to break up into small groups to brainstorm recommendations for the state that came from today’s presentations and discussion. The recommendations that were shared are as follows:

* Monitor document review for sensitive questions.
* Create a video or some type of accessible material that supports the health of all individuals by highlighting that all immigrants are worthy of human rights and there are no good versus bad immigrants.
* Devise ways to highlight the connections across individuals experiencing inequities so a broader social determinants of health view can be taken.
* Enroll low-income students in the lunch program.
* Look at how to continue this group, which is good at unsiloing, and recognize the need to continue to partner outside of the OHE-AC meetings.
* Minimum wage is one way to protect immigrants.
* Make sure employers are not lost out of fear of hiring practices.
* Provide training on civility and how to communicate better with each other with active listening and respect, rules of engagement for dialogue, online etiquette, nonviolent communication, and the rise in hate groups and how they are becoming the norm, especially online.
* Address data equity and data justice
* Who are the people who are using social welfare?
* Collect data and reflect accurately to demystify the needs of the immigrant or undocumented person.
* Disaggregated data is important and should be continually pushed.
* Put resources toward cultural competency and legal resources related to families being separated because of cultural practices.
* Create a clearinghouse of information from the state.
* Produce resources for trauma-informed care and cultural competency.
* Address mental health needs for immigrant communities.
* Put together infographics to parse the whole immigration picture plus the economic impact that immigrants have on the state, etc.
* Fund local health departments to do more work on immigrant health or provide technical assistance.
* Provide information and technical assistance to the WIC program.
* Further discuss long-standing trauma in communities of color.
* Create a nonpartisan statement that is based on research that highlights the fact that policies that penalize and focus on immigrants have a negative impact on the health of all Californians.

Chair Butler asked for feedback on how to make these suggestions actionable.

**Public Comment**

Ms. Jones asked for the state to put out guidance on public health’s responsibility to support and see clients that can even the playing field for local health departments.

**Questions and Discussion**

Ms. Kappagoda made a motion that the OHE-AC issue a statement laying out existing research saying that targeting immigrants negatively impacts the broader community.

Dr. Louie stated that information may already be available in medical journals. Deputy Director Miller suggested putting out guidance that synthesizes what is already out there and strengthens the messaging begun in the newsletter.

Mr. Ewing stated he was uncomfortable voting on statements that members have not read before approval. He suggested waiting until the next meeting to vote on the document after it is written.

Ms. Kappagoda amended her motion to add that the development of a draft will be presented for approval at the next meeting.

Dr. Louie stated a one-size-fits-all template may not be appropriate for all audiences.

**Motion:**

Ms. Kappagoda made a motion that the OHE-AC issue a statement laying out existing research saying that targeting immigrants negatively impacts the broader community, and that the statement will be drafted and presented for approval at the next OHE-AC meeting.

***(Motion made).***

**Vote**: Motion carried 10 yes, 1 no, and 3 abstain, per roll call vote as follows:

The following OHE-AC members voted “Yes”: Chair Butler and Committee members Cheng, Ewert, Galvez, Garza, Johnson, Kappagoda, King, Wheaton, and Witte.

The following OHE-AC members voted “No”: Committee member Louie.

The following OHE-AC members abstained: Committee members Julien, Nadal, and McShan.

Chair Butler asked for volunteers to work on the draft statement. Ms. Kappagoda volunteered.

## 3:30 p.m. Planning for the September 28, 2017, OHE Advisory Committee Meeting

This agenda item was not discussed.

## 3:50 p.m. Debrief | Public Comment Period/Public Comment for Items Not on the Agenda

Shirley Darling stated concern that law enforcement does not respond when the person harmed is homeless.

Ms. McShan thanked Ms. Darling for sharing her story and stated rape of men and women in the homeless community needs to be addressed.

Chair Butler stated homelessness is a topic that keeps coming up and may be an issue to focus on because it extends across a number of areas of concern for this committee.

Dr. Nolfo referred to a health research infographic walking through health outcomes and the social determinants of health, which was included in the meeting packet. She asked for feedback from the OHE-AC members and members of the public.

## 4:00 p.m. Closing Comments and Adjournment

Chair Butler thanked everyone for participating and adjourned the meeting at 4:05 p.m.