



**Office of Health Equity Advisory Committee Meeting
Meeting Minutes (DRAFT Staff Notes)
January 6-7, 2014**



Staff Notes

These are notes of the meeting taken by staff of the California Department of Public Health, Office of Health Equity, and do not constitute formal approved minutes of the meeting.

Location:

**Sutter Health Sacramento
2700 Gateway Oaks Drive, Sacramento, CA 95833**

OHE-AC Members Participating:

Sergio Aguilar-Gaxiola, MD, PhD
Delphine Brody
Jeremy Cantor, MPH
Yvonna Càzares, BA
Rocco Cheng, PhD
Kathleen Derby, MA
Aaron Fox, MPM
Sandi Gàlvez, MSW
Álvaro Garza, MD, MPH
Cynthia Gómez, PhD
Pastor Willie Graham
General Jeff
Carrie Johnson, PhD
Neal Kohatsu, MD, MPH
Dexter Louie, MD, JD, MPA
Francis Lu, MD
Gail Newel, MD, MPH
Teresa Ogan, MSW
Hermia Parks, MA, RN, PHN
Patricia Ryan, MPA
Ellen Wu, MPH
Linda Wheaton, MURP, AICP (Liaison to the Health in All Policies Task Force)

OHE-AC Members Absent:

Paula Braveman, MD, MPH
José Oseguera, MPA
Diana Ramos, MD, MPH

Guests:

Tim Fallon, President TSI Consulting
Laurie Schulte, Vice-President TSI Consulting

State Officials:

Ron Chapman, MD, MPH Director, California Department of Public Health
Jahmal Miller, MHA Deputy Director, Office of Health Equity



**Office of Health Equity Advisory Committee Meeting
Meeting Minutes (DRAFT Staff Notes)
January 6-7, 2014**



Day 1: January 6, 2014

AC Attendees in Person: Sergio Aguilar-Gaxiola, MD, PhD; Delphine Brody; Jeremy Cantor, MPH; Yvonna Càzares, BA; Rocco Cheng, PhD; Aaron Fox, MPM; Sandi Gálvez, MSW; Álvaro Garza, MD, MPH; Cynthia Gómez, PhD; Pastor Willie Graham; General Jeff; Carrie Johnson, PhD; Neal Kohatsu, MD, MPH; Dexter Louie, MD, JD, MPA; Francis Lu, MD; Gail Newel, MD, MPH; Teresa Ogan, MSW; Hermia Parks, MA, RN, PHN; Patricia Ryan, MPA; Ellen Wu, MPH; Linda Wheaton, MURP, AICP

9:00 a.m. Convene Meeting and Welcome

Sandi Galvez, MSW, Chair of the Office of Health Equity (OHE) Advisory Committee (AC), called the OHE-AC meeting to order.

9:15 a.m. Introductions | Agenda Review | Logistics

Sandi Galvez, introduced the OHE-AC members, reviewed the agenda, established a quorum, provided a quick recap of the Bagley-Keene Open Meeting Act requirements, and reviewed the process for public comment periods.

9:35 a.m. Welcome and Introduction of Jahmal Miller, MHA, OHE Deputy Director

Ron Chapman, MD, MPH, CDPH Director, specified the meeting will focus on the strategic plan, introduced meeting facilitators Tim Fallon and Laurie Schulte (President and Vice President, TSI Consulting), thanked Traci Van (Sutter Health Foundation Community Benefit Director) for providing the facility, and introduced Jahmal Miller, MHA, new OHE Deputy Director.

9:40 a.m. OHE Update

Jahmal Miller, OHE Deputy Director, completed an OHE update presentation reviewing the drivers of health inequities, namely the social determinants of health. He also stressed the need to develop a Strategic Plan that reaches beyond OHE, beyond the OHE-AC and includes the business and private sectors. He gave a brief overview of the California Reducing Disparities Project (CRDP), Healthy Community Indicator Project (HCI), Integrated Transport and Health Impacts Module (ITHIM), Climate and Health, Health in All Policy (HiAP) Task Force, the Interagency Agreement Data Work Group, and the Data Report. The discussion period surrounded the importance of comorbidity involving mental health when addressing disparities. AC members mentioned a need to focus on veterans, education, and the disabled. They discussed how data was used, collected, and analyzed to eliminate gaps, and suggested to use social determinants of health. They further stated that there is controversy about diagnostic validity of mental health diagnostic manuals and that the cultural components should be a consideration.

Public Comment:

- **Question:** How can the AC build confidence in the partnership with California Health and Human Services?
Response: Establishing the OHE-AC was the first step toward working together to create transparency, and establishing communication between both private and public sectors. It would be the responsibility of all, in the state of California, to ensure this partnership works.
- **Question:** What is ASTHO?
Response: Association of State and Territorial Health Officials



**Office of Health Equity Advisory Committee Meeting
Meeting Minutes (DRAFT Staff Notes)
January 6-7, 2014**



-
- **Question and Comment:** What are possible road blocks that would keep Californians from reaching their full health potential? Hope the OHE will be radical in its approach to address these road blocks – knowing that the public was in support. A need to disaggregate data on racial groups and include more data on one of the fastest growing populations in California -multiracial individuals.
Response: None provided
 - **Comment:** Consider both physical and mental health when discussing substance abuse.
 - **Comment:** “Collective impact” promotes community-based practices.

10:05 a.m. Roberts Rules of Order Overview

Sandi Galvez provided a quick overview of Roberts Rules of Order.

Public Comment: None

10:15 a.m. Approval of September 26 and 27, Meeting Minutes

Sandi Galvez asked AC members to review the meeting minutes provided in meeting packets.

Motion:

General Jeff motioned to approve the meeting minutes. Sergio Aguilar-Gaxiola, MD, PhD, seconded the motion

Discussion: Sergio Aguilar-Gaxiola questioned the accuracy of the minutes where “AC members addressed the need to establish an aligned message prior to meeting with community leaders” is written. He asked that OHE staff review and consider amending the minutes.

Public Comment: None

Vote:

The vote passed with no opposition. Jahmal Miller assured that the OHE staff will follow up on Sergio Aguilar-Gaxiola’s request to review the accuracy of this statement.

10:30 a.m. Break

10:45 a.m. Review of Bylaws | Bylaw Approval

Sandi Galvez announced the bylaws review will be postponed until the March OHE-AC meeting because the CDPH Legal Office made last minute suggestions to the bylaws that must be incorporated and re-reviewed prior to taking a vote to accept.

11:15 a.m. Vice-Chair Nominations | Election

Sandi Galvez provided an overview of the OHE-AC Vice-Chair duties, term, and eligibilities. The nominees for Vice-Chair were General Jeff and Rocco Cheng. The Vice-Chair nominees each provided a brief presentation; the vote was held by secret ballot and OHE staff collected and tallied the votes.

Vote:

The tallied votes revealed Rocco Cheng was elected. Nineteen AC members voted. From these 19 votes, Rocco Cheng received 15 votes; General Jeff received 4.



**Office of Health Equity Advisory Committee Meeting
Meeting Minutes (DRAFT Staff Notes)
January 6-7, 2014**



Public Comment:

- **Comment:** One person offered his services as a potential alternate council member.

11:30 a.m. Introduction of Tim Fallon and Laurie Schulte

Jahmal Miller re-introduced Tim Fallon and Laurie Schulte. Tim Fallon provided an overview of what a successful and effective strategic plan is. He reviewed the planning process, how to promptly formulate a “good enough” strategic plan, specified a need for immediate implementation and regular progress tracking, how to make real-time adjustment to strategies, and the need to focus on the results. He highlighted challenges to the strategic plan, distinguished the difference between a comprehensive and a strategic plan, and a need to leverage resources across sectors. He mentioned a need for stakeholders’ feedback on the strategic mapping and how it would provide a concise graphic display serving as a powerful communication tool. Within the discussion period, AC members advised OHE to carefully consider resources used for each category, the roles of OHE staff during the strategic process, a need for public input, and analyzing gaps in the disparities data. An AC member advocated for a well thought out plan instead of a “good enough” plan. Tim Fallon, explained, the “good enough” principle did not mean quality does not matter, it was meant in the context of ensuring timeliness and accomplishing the best possible plan within the timeline. Sandi Galvez, Chair asked AC members to approach the process with an open mind.

Public Comment:

- **Comment:** Multiple people expressed the need to get a plan implemented instead of allowing office politics to get in the way.
- **Comment:** There was a request to distinguish between the CRDP strategic plan and the OHE-AC strategic plan to avoid confusion.
- **Comment:** AC members were asked to consider addressing differences in language, semantics, and assurances that the document would be accessible to everyone.

12:00 p.m. Break for Lunch

1.15 p.m. OHE Strategic Plan Health and Mental Health Disparities and Inequities Framework/California’s Current Situation

During the working session facilitated by Laurie Schulte, AC members were separated into small groups of four where they discussed California health equity strategies, addressing strengths to build on, critical health equity issues, and barriers and obstacles to overcome. Each group reported back their results after 45 minutes. AC members provided feedback on each group’s presentation. The overall feedback specified a need for more nuance, highlighted concerns for the timeline, and a need to capture constituents’ and stakeholder input.

Public Comment:

- **Comment:** Suggested an oversight commission at the local level was suggested when working with mental illness.
- **Comment:** A request was made to institutionalize the data collecting process to reflect race and ethnicity and mentioned a struggle with government and Non-Government Organization hiring on the basis of cronyism.
- **Comment:** The Collective Impact approach was mentioned and explained as a community-based infrastructure involving schools, health care facilities, and social services working collectively as a health enterprise.



Office of Health Equity Advisory Committee Meeting Meeting Minutes (DRAFT Staff Notes) January 6-7, 2014



- **Comment:** Lack of representation for the Arab population and immigrants from the Middle East within the OHE-AC was pointed out. Additionally, it was mentioned that community-based practices may not necessarily coincide with the Western concept of health care.
- **Response:** An AC member inquired about the “Collective Impact” article and Neal Kohatsu, MD, MPH, offered to distribute a copy.

2:45 p.m. Break

3:00 p.m. OHE Strategic Plan (Continuation)

Tim Fallon and Laurie Schulte provided an overview of the key elements to the strategic framework, which included a mission and vision statement, a strategy, the norms, and the tactics. He then suggested to build the mission language from legislative language and requested AC members to contribute toward the development of the mission statement. AC members suggested the statement should address both the “current” and “historic” tense, add “highest quality of life,” consider a language format understood by all populations, and include physical and mental health. Due to similarities within the language, AC members were confused on whether the mission statement was meant for the OHE office or AC members. A few AC members felt both statements should reflect the same message and wanted to move past wordsmithing to focus on the strategic plan.

AC members provided concise phrases that captured what they viewed as the central challenges including gaps with leadership, priorities, race, class, gender, culture, resources, funding, accessibilities, actual utilizations, political will, communication, genuine commitment, humanity and equalizing opportunities for all to get good health, and fear of losing power and privilege.

4:00 p.m. Wrap Up

Tim Fallon, President, TSI Consulting closed the day by asking and addressing the following questions:

- What has been accomplished?
- Where are we in the process?
- What will the next day’s agenda include?
- What are the next steps?

Public Comment:

- **Comment:** Health disparity and equity as a fundamental value, personal freedom, and responsibility and how people may find it easier to blame others when they have to give something up.
- **Comment:** Mission statement language was brought up as a focus point.
- **Comment:** Take care using the word “opportunity.”
- **Comment:** Recommendation to use the terminology “highest” health quality standard of life.
- **Comment:** Highlighted the biggest challenge on eliminating disparities was due to lack of grounded individuals, community, and knowledge of diverse cultures.
- **Comment:** Suggestion that a brief summary of the public comments be included in future meeting minutes.

4:45 p.m. Closing Comments and adjournment

Sandi Galvez adjourned the meeting.



**Office of Health Equity Advisory Committee Meeting
Meeting Minutes (DRAFT Staff Notes)
January 6-7, 2014**



Day 2: January 7, 2014

AC Attendees in Person: Sergio Aguilar-Gaxiola, MD, PhD; Delphine Brody; Jeremy Cantor, MPH; Yvonna Cázares, BA; Rocco Cheng, PhD; Kathleen Derby, MA; Aaron Fox, MPM; Sandi Gálvez, MSW; Álvaro Garza, MD, MPH; Cynthia Gómez, PhD; Pastor Willie Graham; General Jeff; Carrie Johnson, PhD; Neal Kohatsu, MD, MPH; Dexter Louie, MD, JD, MPA; Francis Lu, MD; Gail Newel, MD, MPH; Teresa Ogan, MSW; Hermia Parks, MA, RN, PHN; Patricia Ryan, MPA; Ellen Wu, MPH; Linda Wheaton, MURP, AICP

9:00 a.m. Convene Meeting and Welcome

Sandi Galvez called the second day of the OHE-AC meeting to order.

9:15 a.m. OHE Strategic Plan: Central Challenge and Strategic Priorities

Tim Fallon provided draft mission and vision statements developed from the previous day's discussions, laid out a plan for the morning, and presented AC members with three discussion items to review:

- Assumptions to guide development of California's health equity strategy
- The central challenge California faces in addressing health equity
- Key strategic priorities of the health equity strategy

An AC member asked about the purpose of the strategic plan, who it would help, and will it move to action. Tim Fallon explained that the OHE is a vehicle to empower individuals, organizations, and communities to reduce health disparities in California and the office could not do this task alone. Jahmal Miller, pointed out the partnership with the Health in All Policy (HiAP) Task Force, the need to work with academic institutions, and community organizations, foundations, and other state agencies such as CDPH, DHCS, CDE, and CalEPA to address and tackle the statewide inequities.

Mission/Vision discussion:

Laurie Schultz specified the importance of having a clear understanding of why the OHE exists and that the vision would provide the end-state of what to achieve. AC members suggested to move forward, focus on priorities, and start drafting the strategic plan.

Motion:

Neal Kohatsu motioned to accept the vision statement, "Everyone in California has equal opportunities for optimal health and well-being." Dexter Louie, MD, JD, MPA, seconded the motion.

Discussion: One AC member specified he was not comfortable with voting to approve something not in its final form.

Public Comment:

- The OHE guidance document should align with legislation, engage stakeholders, and not get side-tracked.
- Language for the vision statement should include, "California systems promote optimal health and well-being for everyone."



**Office of Health Equity Advisory Committee Meeting
Meeting Minutes (DRAFT Staff Notes)
January 6-7, 2014**



Vote:

Sandi Galvez called for a vote to adopt “in concept” the vision statement, “Everyone in California has equal opportunities for optimal health and well-being.” The vote yielded 9 yeses, 8 noes, and 2 abstentions; the motion carried.

Strategic Mapping:

Tim Fallon and Laure Schulte developed a working draft of the strategic map with the central challenge as the focal point based on their synthesis of the previous day’s discussions. Tim highlighted the need for strategic priorities and to verify if challenges were met.

AC members felt the central challenge did not capture their goals or address health inequities. They provided suggestions to modify the central challenge to focus on physical and mental health, use supportive words, advocate health equity in all policies, and to incorporate words like “institutes,” “commitment,” “social determinants,” and “access to” within the language.

10:30 a.m. Break

10:45 a.m. Strategic Mapping (Continuation)

AC members continued discussions on the central challenge language, the strategic approach, and how to include input from the Health in All Policies Task Force. AC members were given an assignment to review the strategic challenge and strategic priorities, discuss in small groups, and provide recommendations for changes to be made.

12:00 p.m. Break for Lunch

1:15 p.m. OHE Strategic Plan: Setting Preliminary Strategic Objectives

AC members separated into small groups to discuss preliminary identification of the strategic objectives that supported each strategic priority, identify outstanding questions and issues, and review next steps to prepare for the March OHE-AC meeting. AC members provided their goals, challenges, and strategic priorities. An AC member mentioned resource and the “isms” as an overarching topic.

Public Comment:

- **Comment:** Focus on the need of a whole person’s health and do not follow the social Darwinism model.
- **Comment:** “Collective Impact” allowed a commenter and his team, made up of county, state, and community business owners, to share in decision making.

Tim Fallon and Laurie Schulte gathered input and provided and developed themes to establish commonalities for the central challenge language. AC members felt the challenges presented were tactics and not challenges. Tim clarified the purpose was to come to consensus to establish final wording that will be shared with the community. He explained that the mission is a long-term goal and the central challenge is what needs to be addressed in the next three years. The end result would include a mission, vision, central challenge, strategic priorities, and tactics. Dr. Chapman reminded AC members that the strategic map is only a tool. Toward the end of the central challenge session, AC members agreed on the phrase, “Mobilize understanding and sustained commitment to eliminate health inequity and improve the health, mental health and well-being of all.”



Office of Health Equity Advisory Committee Meeting
Meeting Minutes (DRAFT Staff Notes)
January 6-7, 2014



2:45 p.m. Break

3:00 p.m. OHE Strategic Plan (Continuation)

Motion:

Cynthia Gomez, PhD, motioned to consider creating a separate vision, mission, and central challenge with OHE-AC's own words and Neal Kohatsu seconded the motion.

Discussion:

Many AC members opposed the motion. They did not want to rehash what was already established and wanted to be able to provide updates to the communities they represented.

Motion:

Sandi Galvez moved to table the motion and made an alternative motion to make the statement provided by group number three, the mission. Dexter Louie called for a "point of order" stating the motion on the table took precedence. Cynthia Gomez withdrew her motion.

Motion:

Sandi Galvez moved to make "ensure equitable social, economic, and environmental conditions to achieve optimal health and mental health for all" the mission statement and Cynthia Gomez seconded the motion.

Discussion:

General Jeff proposed to amend the motion by adding "well-being for all" to the end of Sandi Galvez's motion and withdrew after hearing Tim Fallon explain that "well-being" was part of the central challenge and the current motion on the floor was for the mission. Discussion among AC members reflected confusion between the OHE mission and the strategic plan's mission statement. It was clarified by an AC member that the mission was for the strategic plan.

Delphine Brody proposed to amend the first word of the mission statement to "promote" instead of "ensure" and General Jeff seconded the amendment.

Public Comment: None

Discussion Continued:

Sergio Aguilar-Gaxiola motioned to amend and include "mental health and well-being for all." Dexter Louie raised a point of order that the Chair needed to deal with first level amendments (made by Brody/Jeff above) before a new amendment could be considered. Delphine Brody withdrew her previous amendment and motioned a new amendment to include Sergio Aguilar-Gaxiola's words "mental health and well-being." General Jeff seconded the amendment.

Public Comment:

- **Comment:** A public comment made by phone supported using the term "well-being."



**Office of Health Equity Advisory Committee Meeting
Meeting Minutes (DRAFT Staff Notes)
January 6-7, 2014**



Vote:

Sandi Galvez called for a vote to amend the motion from “achieve optimal health and mental health for all” to include “well-being.” The amendment passed with 16 votes in favor; none opposed. The motion passed.

Discussion:

AC members expressed concerns regarding the language and how it did not capture the statute, while a few members were content with the language and saw it aligned with the statute. Sandi Galvez, OHE-AC Chair opened floor for public comment.

Public Comment: None

Vote:

Sandi Galvez called for a vote on the amended motion “Promote equitable social, economic, and environmental conditions to achieve optimal health, mental health, and well-being for all.” The motion passed with 15 in favor; one opposed.

Tim Fallon provided a summary of how to prepare and compress priorities for vetting. AC members requested to have vision, mission, and central challenges put in bullet point format for an easy vetting process. AC members were advised the OHE-AC strategic plan integrated appropriately to CDPH’s strategic plan. AC members continued discussions on how to develop a communication process that followed Bagley-Keene due to the large laundry list to achieve.

Motion:

General Jeff moved to have OHE-AC Chair and Vice-Chair develop a list of strategic priorities in consultation with TSI, to present to OHE-AC members at the next meeting. Alvaro Garza, MD, MPH, seconded the motion.

Discussion: None

Public Comment:

- **Comment:** There is a need for context in order to get public input on the strategic priorities, suggesting this could be done at the March meeting.

Vote:

Sandi Galvez called for a vote on the motion. There were 17 in favor of the motion, zero opposed, and zero abstained. The motion was passed.

Tim Fallon provided two options to capture feedback from constituents: to approach constituents directly or provide online survey options, which can readily be accessible to the public. An AC member wanted to know if the survey would be provided in Spanish. Another expressed concern for the timeline while others felt the online survey would capture the younger audiences. AC members considered how to strategically capture public input and continued discussion on how they would rely heavily on the OHE-AC Chair and Vice-Chair to represent on their behalf. A need for clarification on Bagley-Keene was requested for the next meeting.



**Office of Health Equity Advisory Committee Meeting
Meeting Minutes (DRAFT Staff Notes)
January 6-7, 2014**



Connie Mitchell, MD, from the Office of Health Equity, provided a quick summary of the disparities report data points for OHE-AC members to review. Included within their packets was a matrix that listed statutory requirements for the A-N data points. She asked for feedback from AC members.

Public Comment:

- **Comment:** They did not want the AC's smart and hard work to get compromised at the Capitol and wanted to hear the methodology the OHE-AC will implement to maintain the intent of their work.
Response: It was pointed out that the establishment of the Office of Health Equity provided an opportunity to have a voice and a strategic opportunity to hold government officials accountable.
- **Comment:** A caller thanked the OHE Community Development and Engagement Unit for working with them to coordinate an upcoming visit to the City of Marin.

4:45 p.m. Closing Comments and adjournment

Motion:

Sandi Galvez moved to adjourn the meeting and General Jeff seconded the motion.

Discussion: None

Vote:

The final voting results showed all were in favor and zero opposed to adjourn the meeting. Sandi Galvez adjourned the meeting.